



**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

IN RE: PHILIPS RECALLED CPAP,)	
BI-LEVEL PAP, AND MECHANICAL)	
VENTILATOR PRODUCTS)	Master Docket: Misc. No. 21-1230
LITIGATION)	
)	
)	MDL No. 3014
This Document Relates to: All Actions)	
)	
)	
)	

PRETRIAL ORDER #2

WITH RESEPECT TO (1) INTERIM MODIFICATIONS TO THE PRESERVATION REQUIREMENTS AND (2) APPOINTMENT OF INTERIM LEAD PLAINTIFFS' COUNSEL FOR THE PURPOSE OF NEGOTIATING AN INTERIM PROPOSED PRESERVATION ORDER

WHEREFORE this court entered Pretrial Order #1, pursuant to which it, among other things, ordered the parties to preserve evidence that may be relevant to this multi-district litigation (“MDL”) (ECF No. 4 ¶ 13);

WHEREFORE defendant Philips RS North America LLC (“Respironics”) filed an emergency motion to stay or amend portions of paragraph 13 of Pretrial Order #1 (the “emergency motion”) (ECF No. 8), a brief in support of the emergency motion (ECF No. 9), and a reply brief in support of the emergency motion (ECF No. 24), in which it requested that the court stay paragraph 13 to the extent it prohibited Respironics from continuing to rework and replace recalled DreamStation 1 devices (the “DreamStation 1 Devices”) as required by the U.S. Food and Drug Administration (the “FDA Recall Remediation”) or precluded any plaintiff or putative class member from submitting his or her recalled device to Respironics for replacement or repair as part of the FDA Recall Remediation; and

WHEREFORE various plaintiffs filed responses in opposition to the emergency motion and briefs in support of those responses (ECF Nos. 11, 12, 15, 22, 23, 29);

NOW, this 19th day of November 2021,

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED that the emergency motion (ECF No. 8) is **GRANTED IN PART** and **DENIED IN PART** as set forth in this Pretrial Order #2;

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that—until further order of this court—paragraph 13 of Pretrial Order #1 is modified on an interim basis with respect to the DreamStation 1 Devices sent to Respironics for remediation, as follows:

- (A) plaintiffs and putative class members may submit their recalled DreamStation 1 Devices to Respironics for replacement or repair pursuant to the FDA Recall Remediation;
- (B) Respironics may continue to replace or remediate and return to users their DreamStation 1 Devices as required by the FDA Recall Remediation subject to the preservation requirements set forth in Pretrial Order #1, as modified by this Pretrial Order #2;
- (C) with respect to the insect-infested DreamStation 1 Devices, if not returned to the sender, Respironics must retain a record of all insect-infested DreamStation 1 Devices of which it disposes, record and retain a list of the sender and—if reasonably possible—user of the DreamStation 1 Devices, and take a photograph of the insect-infested DreamStation 1 Devices; Respironics, however, is not required to preserve the insect-infested DreamStation 1 Devices;
- (D) with respect to all the DreamStation 1 Devices sent to Respironics as part of the FDA Recall Remediation that will be replaced rather than repaired, Respironics must preserve, store, and catalogue those DreamStation 1 Devices so that the DreamStation 1 Device can, if possible, be traced back to the specific individual who used that device; and
- (E) with respect to all the DreamStation 1 Devices sent to Respironics as part of the FDA Recall Remediation that will be remediated and returned to the sender, Respironics must preserve, store, and catalogue with the original serial number the blower box, PE-PUR foam, and SD card removed from any retrofitted

DreamStation 1 Device so that the blower box, PE-PUR foam, and SD card can be traced back to the specific individual who used that device.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that—*for the sole purpose of negotiating an interim proposed preservation order with respect to Respironics’ remediation of the DreamStation 1 Devices*—the following counsel are appointed as plaintiffs’ interim lead counsel:

Ellen Relkin

Weitz & Luxenberg, P.C.
220 Lake Drive East, Suite 220
Cherry Hill, NJ 08002
P: (856)-755-1115
erelkin@weitzlux.com;

Kelly K. Iverson

Lynch Carpenter, LLP
1133 Penn Avenue, 5th Floor
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
P: (412) 322-9243
kelly@lcllp.com;

Kimberly Barone Baden

Motley Rice LLC
28 Bridgeside Boulevard
Mount Pleasant, SC 29464
P: (843) 216-9000
kbarone@motleyrice.com;

Dena C. Sharp

Girard Sharp LLP
601 California Street, Suite 1400
San Francisco, CA 94108
P: (415) 981-4800
dsharp@girardsharp.com;

David S. Stellings

Lieff Cabraser Heimann & Bernstein, LLP
250 Hudson Street, 8th Floor
New York, NY 100313-1436
P: (212) 355-9500
dstellings@lchb.com; and

Christian Bagin

Wienand and Bagin
100 1st Avenue, Suite 1010
Pittsburgh, PA 15222
P: 412-281-1110
christian@wienandandbagin.com;

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the appointment of interim lead counsel for the limited purpose set forth in this order is not any indication this court will appoint any of the interim lead counsel to the Plaintiffs’ Steering Committee (“PSC”) or as a lead counsel for any other purpose;

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that reimbursement for costs and/or fees for services of the interim lead counsel will be set at a time and in a manner established by the court after due notice to all counsel and after a hearing;

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the counsel for Respironics and the interim lead plaintiffs' counsel appointed pursuant to this order shall promptly meet and confer to negotiate a proposed interim preservation order with respect to Respironics' remediation of the DreamStation 1 Devices pursuant to the FDA Recall Remediation to be filed with this court **on or before December 10, 2021**;

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that if interim lead counsel want to retain an expert for the purpose of advising them with respect to preservation issues, Respironics must provide the expert access on a reasonable basis to the DreamStation 1 Devices returned to Respironics pursuant to the FDA Recall Remediation that are in Respironics' possession as well as any materials removed from the DreamStation 1 Devices as part of the FDA Recall Remediation;

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that the court will address the proposed interim preservation order at the status conference set for December 15, 2021, at 2:00 p.m., and, if adopted by the court, the interim preservation order will be subject to the appointed lead counsel, after consultation with the PSC, negotiating a final proposed preservation order with Respironics; and

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Pretrial Order #1 with respect to all other matters set forth therein remains in full force and effect.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

/s/ JOY FLOWERS CONTI

Joy Flowers Conti

Senior United States District Court Judge